

RELIGIOUS AND POLITICAL IDENTITY IN MEDIEVAL EUROPE: PURITY OF FAITH AND HERESY

EMILIO MITRE
UNIVERSIDAD COMPLUTENSE DE MADRID
SPAIN

Date of receipt: 30th of August, 2019

Date of acceptance: 17th of February, 2020

ABSTRACT

This article provides a diachronic and overall view to analyze the creation of an identity in medieval Europe expressed in religious and political terms and created from contrasting an internal cohesion confronted towards external otherness. This imposed a conceptual trajectory, begun in the disquisition between pontifical theocracy and imperial Caesaropapism and following through the acceptance of the plurality of feudal monarchies and a segregating reaction in the late Middle Ages, focused on the purity of faith isolating groups and beliefs that could stain the society. The link between divine guidance and people facilitated that the political discourse at the end of the Middle Ages integrated the influence of messianism-millennarianism.

KEYWORDS

Religion, Christianity, Faith, Heresy, Identity, Otherness.

CAPITALIA VERBA

Religio, Christianitas, Fides, Haeresis, Identitas, Alteritas.

1. The great propositions and their vicissitudes¹

Identity² —often induced from high instances— covers distinct fields. In the political-religious aspect concerning our society, the starting point could well be the *grand dessein* entailed by the Edict of Thessalonica promulgated by Theodosius in 380. As Nicenean orthodoxy identified divinity with the maintenance of the human institutions, it was imposed as a citizenship charter for the empire.³ The followers of heresies, those who had earned imperial punishment in the present and divine punishment in the future, were excluded from the community.⁴ The closure of the Academy of Athens (the last redoubt of pagan neo-Platonism) by Justinian in 529 was the symbolic end of a programme of marked standardisation.⁵

1.1 Internal and external enemies

The Roman world understood the relation between identity and otherness⁶ in a double sense: outwards through the existence of *hostes extranei* who were the

1. The author has written others works on the same theme. See Mitre Fernández, Emilio. “Herejías y comunidades nacionales en el Medievo”. *Ílu. Revista de Ciencias de las Religiones*, 1 (1996): 85-104; Mitre Fernández, Emilio. *Ortodoxia y herejía entre la Antigüedad y el Medievo*. Madrid: Cátedra, 2003; Mitre Fernández, Emilio. *Los credos medievales y el espejo de la herejía*. Madrid: A.C. Castellum, 2006; Mitre Fernández, Emilio. *Iglesia, herejía y vida política en la Europa Medieval*. Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2007; Mitre Fernández, Emilio. *Una primera Europa. Romanos, cristianos y germanos (400-1000)*. Madrid: Encuentro, 2009; and, especially, the text of a talk (unpublished) under the title “Identidades religiosas y poderes políticos en el Occidente medieval”, given at one of the Summer Courses at the Universidad Complutense de Madrid held in El Escorial (*Identidad y alteridad en la Historia: de la caverna al estado-nación*) on 24th July 2007.

2. Fritz Stern considered that “identity” would be a modern way to refer to the *Unbewusstes Selbstvertrauen* (“unaware self-confidence”). Stern, Fritz. *Verspielte Größe. Essays zur deutschen Geschichte des 20. Jahrhunderts*. Munich: C.H. Beck, 1996: 285; Fritz Stern, “Verlorene Heimat”, a talk given in Berlin on 1st June 1995 and referring to the feelings of the German population from the East of the Reich displaced by the Soviet offensive and the later readjustments of the frontiers that happened after the 1945 defeat. Bessel, Richard. *Alemania 1945, de la guerra a la paz*. Barcelona: Ediciones B, 2009: 13, 468. Of great interest for the epoch that concerns us here is Babel, Rainer; Moeglin, Jean-Marie, eds. *Identité régionale et conscience nationale en France et en Allemagne du Moyen Age a l'époque moderne*. Sigmaringen: J. Thorbecke, 1997.

3. Expression by Cochrane, Charles Norris. *Cristianismo y cultura clásica*. Mexico D.F.: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 1939: 331.

4. Theodosius. “Selecta de religione decreta”, *Patrologiae. Cursus completus*. Paris: Jacques-Paul Migne editorem, 1845: XIII, col. 530-531 (*Codex Theodosianus*, lib. XVI, I, 2-3). Two good recent biographies about this emperor are the ones by Maraval, Pierre. *Théodose le Grand. Le pouvoir et la foi*. Paris: Fayard, 2010; Bravo, Gonzalo. *Teodosio. Último emperador de Roma, primer emperador católico*. Madrid: La Esfera de los Libros, 2010.

5. This Justinian adopted the posture of the emperor Julian, but giving it a different twist; the educator has to remain in the framework of the official doctrine. Ducellier, Alain; Kaplan, Michel. “El imperio cristiano, realización del Imperio romano”, *Bizancio y el mundo ortodoxo*, Alain Ducellier, ed. Madrid: Mondadori, 1992: 72.

6. For an overview of the other in history, see Benito Ruano, Eloy. *De la alteridad en la Historia*. Madrid: Real Academia de la Historia, 1988.



barbarian peoples; and inwards through the *hostes domestici* that were the vices resulting from the loss of the old citizen virtues.⁷

The Romans took the idea of barbarity from the Greeks. The latter lumped together a wide range of people in this category, linked only by not using or the Hellenic language or customs, even including a civilisation as developed as Achaemenid Persia. For Rome, the barbarians were the people who lived beyond the *limes*. They were simply foreigners, a rather derogatory expression given the high opinion Rome had of itself.⁸ Another question is that the military and economic requirements of the Empire forced it to resort to people from outside, with which, in an enshrined expression, Rome was becoming barbarised to the same extent the barbarians were being Romanised.⁹

Over the years, propitiated by the spread of Christianity, the idea of barbarian acquired new profiles. In line with the conception of Optatus of Milevis in the mid fourth century (*christianus quia romanus*), the barbarian was not so much one who lacked Roman citizenship but more the lack of that faith in Christ that converted one into a member of that mystical Augustinian *civitas Dei*.¹⁰

The frequent convergence of these two ideas (foreignness and the absence of the true faith) in certain communities converted them into participants in that established double hostility towards Rome and everything that it signified. This situation became more acute with the division of the empire on the death of Theodosius and the Germanic migrations that fragmented its *pars occidentis*.¹¹ The barbarian continued to be the foreigner but also anyone who had entered recognisable frontiers but who did not profess the faith of Nicea.¹² This opened the way for the creation of new identities in which the religious aspect would be dominant.

1.2 Pontifical theocracy and imperial Caesaropapism

Talking about “historical failures” is an extended resort. A model would undoubtedly be that of the two great universal projects of the Medioevo—Empire and

7. Mazzarino, Santo. *El fin del mundo antiguo*. Mexico D.F.: Uteha, 1961: 35 and following.

8. Musset, Lucien. *Las invasiones. Las oleadas germánicas*. Barcelona: Labor, 1973: 153.

9. On this subject, a classic that is no longer frequently cited is Reynold, Gonzague de. *El mundo bárbaro y su fusión con el romano*. 2. *Los germanos*. Madrid: Pegaso, 1955.

10. Augustine of Hippo. *La Ciudad de Dios*, ed. Francisco Montes de Oca. Mexico D.F.: Porrúa, 1978: 332 (book 15, chapter 1).

11. There is a very abundant bibliography for the study of the crisis and downfall of the Western Empire. We simply refer (and for obvious reasons of co-authorship) to one single: Bravo, Gonzalo, ed. *La caída del Imperio Romano y la génesis de Europa. Cinco nuevas visiones*. Madrid: Editorial Complutense, 2001. For the historical awareness of these changes among the Christians, see Inglebert, Hervé. *Les romains chrétiens face l'histoire de Rome. Histoire, christianisme et romanités en occident dans l'antiquité tardive (III^e-V^e siècle)*. Paris: Institut d'Études Augustiniennes, 1996.

12. Fontaine, Jacques. “Chrétiens et barbares”. *Romanobarbarica*, 2 (1977): 27-57. At a late date (the seventh century), and in the *Vida de San Columbano*, *barbari* were the pagan Alemanni and the Arian Lombards, not the Franks or Burgundians, who were officially Catholics. Geary, Patrick. *Quand les nations refont l'histoire. L'invention des origines médiévales de l'Europe*. Paris: Flammarion, 2006: 178.



Church— both of which, erected as defenders of the purity of the faith, recognised the need for higher guiding power.

From when could these projects be considered frustrated? In the field of spiritual power, the desideratum defended from the Christian east of a pentarchy as the guiding force against papal absolutism ultimately proved impossible. The most glaring symbol of that failure would be, from 1054, the Greco-Roman schism whose consequences, not only religious but also political, are still latent.¹³

The pontifical authority in the West had notable difficulties to impose *la doctrine selon laquelle l'Église détient la souveraineté dans les affaires temporelles*.¹⁴ The outcome came in the early sixteenth century and had a metaphor in the building of the basilica of Saint Peter's in Rome. Begun as a project that would symbolise the universal power of the papacy, by the time of its completion, the popes only ruled over the two Mediterranean peninsulas, with the fate of France in doubt, as was that of a good part of Central Europe.¹⁵

From the viewpoint of political power —the *imperium*— certain more or less universalist myths have persisted; in a leading position, that of Charlemagne after his imperial coronation at Christmas 800.¹⁶ However, as is well known, his project suffered seriously under the reign of his successor Louis.¹⁷ The empire survived in name alone and, in practice, it was mortally wounded in the Treaty of Verdun in 843 signed by the founder's grandchildren after their clash in the bloody Battle of Fontenoy,¹⁸ seen by some as the first European civil war.

Something similar should be said about the other attempt at imperial restoration: the Ottonians in 962 carried this out in a more limited territorial framework than the Carolingians.¹⁹ In the early fourteenth century, and against those who defended that “each king is the emperor in his kingdom”, Dante still sustained the idea of a monarchy or empire, Roman in nature, as a necessity for the world.²⁰ This principle would lose political and ideological force until the eighteenth century, when Voltaire stated that the so-called Holy Roman Empire was neither an empire, nor holy or

13. There is an overview of these relations between Rome and Constantinople in a brilliant summary by Dvornick, François. *Bizancio y el primado Romano*. Bilbao: Desclee de Brouwer, 1968.

14. “the doctrine through which the Church holds sovereignty in temporal affairs”. Pacaut, Marcel. *La théocratie. L'Eglise et le pouvoir au Moyen Âge*. Paris: Aubier, 1957: 7. This is a very useful work and a later complement is Schatz, Klaus. *El primado del papa. Su historia desde los orígenes hasta nuestros días*. Santander: Sal Terrae, 1996.

15. Aretin, Karl Otman von. *El papado y el mundo moderno*. Madrid: Guadarrama, 1970: 12.

16. See the study by Folz, Robert. *Le couronnement imperial de Charlemagne*. Paris: Gallimard, 1989.

17. For the legacy of Charlemagne, see Godman, Peter; Collins, Roger, eds. *Charlemagne's Heir. New Perspectives on the Reigns of Louis The Pious (814-840)*. Oxford-New York: Clarendon Press, 1990.

18. The historian Nithard, illegitimate son of one of Charlemagne's daughters, bequeathed us an excellent view of this turbulent epoch in Nithard. *Histoire des fils de Louis le Pieux*, ed. Philippe Lauer. Paris: Champion, 1926.

19. A useful view of what the Empire meant in the Medievo is still that of Folz, Robert. *L'idée d'Empire en Occident du V au XIV siècle*. Paris: Aubier, 1953.

20. Alighieri, Dante. *De la monarquía*, trans. Ernesto Palacio. Buenos Aires: Losada, 1966: 46 (book 1, chapter 12).



Roman. It can seem like a witticism applicable to the political situation this entity found itself in during the Age of Enlightenment.²¹ However, it is no less true that the solemnity of the formula hardly managed to hide many weaknesses of this political construction over the years, from its medieval genesis to its official disappearance at the start of the nineteenth century, which went almost unnoticed.²²

1.3 From uniqueness to plurality: the so-called feudal monarchies

In an excessively generalising pamphlet, Edgar Morin wrote that *esta invención europea, la nación, se construyó entonces (en la Edad Moderna) sobre la base de una purificación religiosa*.²³ This observation could be a complement to another earlier rather bitter one vented by J. Benda shortly after the Second World War, *el destino de Europa no es su unidad sino el crear naciones que acaban enfrentándose entre ellas*.²⁴ However, could the origin of this process not be made to date back to the epoch of the barbarian kingdoms at the start of the Middle Ages, preamble to the so-called feudal monarchies?²⁵ To what extent did these entities use the defence of the righteous doctrinal opinion (orthodoxy) as an instrument of internal cohesion against the forces considered dissolvent: the heresies, the schism, Judaic or Islamic contaminations—sometimes identified with heresy itself²⁶ or the pure and simple persistence of pagan traditions identified with superstitions?²⁷ In short, a small scale application of the Theodosian ideal of 380. A well-known author popularised an expression: micro-Christianities that would correspond, *grosso modo* in their political dimension, to the kingdoms that arose after the dissolution of the Western Empire.²⁸

21. Quoted by Noël, Jean François. *Le Saint-Empire*. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1976: 66-67.

22. In contrast, Chateaubriand recalled the shock of the execution of Louis XVI some years earlier and which caused a tremendous comotion among the crowned heads of Europe. Chateaubriand, François-René. *Memorias de ultratumba*, eds. Marc Fumaroli, Jean Claude Berchet, José Ramón Monreal. Barcelona: Acantilado, 2004: 989-990.

23. "This European invention, the nation, was built then (in the Modern Age) on the base of religious purification". Morin, Edgar. *Breve historia de la barbarie*. Barcelona: Paidós, 2005: 25. Given its elemental nature, it is not precisely among this author's most notable works.

24. "the fate of Europe is not its unity but rather the creation of nations that end up clashing with each other". Benda, Julien. "La conciencia de la unidad europea", *El espíritu europeo*, ed. Julián Marías. Madrid: Guadarrama, 1957: 30-31.

25. An expression of the "feudal monarchy" that, while its terms might irritate some, is sufficiently consecrated, at least, since the publication of a work that has become a classic: Petit-Dutaillis, Charles. *La monarchie féodale en France et en Angleterre (X-XII siècle)*. Paris: La Renaissance du livre, 1933. While now dated in many of its approaches, it has fortunately been republished on various occasions with the consequent bibliographic *addendae*. For an application of the principle beyond the Anglo-French setting, see Pascual Echegaray, Esther. *Guerra y pacto en el siglo XII. La consolidación de un sistema de reinos en Europa occidental*. Madrid: Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, 1996.

26. See Mitre Fernández, Emilio. *Los credos medievales...*

27. Schmitt, Jean Claude. *Historia de la superstición*. Barcelona: Crítica, 1992: 9.

28. Brown, Peter. *El primer milenio de la Cristiandad Occidental*. Barcelona: Crítica, 1997: 188 and following.



A reading of the pages written recently by Bruno Dumezil is useful for getting to the roots of the problem. In principle, he defines three levels in this process: a Germanic ruling minority with tendency towards Arianism, the Orthodox provincial elites, and the essentially pagan mass of the population.²⁹ The tensions between these tendencies generated more than a few conflicts before orthodoxy was officially imposed.

2. The view of 'oneself' as a model of integrity

When defining a political identity with a religious base, one must play with two opposing but complementary images. They may be mere inductions by elites but with there is no doubt about the power of social recruitment: How do I see myself from a feeling of non-contamination in matters of faith or simply of moral rectitude? How do I see "the other" (internal or external) who, in the case of a political confrontation, for example? I stigmatise with certain religious or simply moral defects?³⁰

2.1 Some initial generalisations

In the first of these cases—which we could call positive identity—this is not necessarily a case of a state, country, nation or kingdom with precise frontiers as these are relatively recent creations. We are, in principle, talking about peoples designated by the Romans as *nationes* or *gentes*, rather diffuse concepts (sometimes associated with the term *barbari*) that would have a more political sense in the former case, a more ethnic one in the latter.³¹

29. Dumezil, Bruno. *Les racines chrétiennes de l'Europe. Conversion et liberté dans les royaumes barbares (V^e-VIII^e siècle)*. Paris: Fayard, 2005. These questions were the themes of two meetings held in the Centro Italiano di Studi Sull'Alto Medioevo in Spoleto: the 14th, held in 1966 about *La conversione al Cristianesimo nell'Europa dell'Alto Medioevo*, and the 28th, in 1980 about *Cristianizzazione ed organizzazione ecclesiastica delle campagne nell'Alto Medioevo: Espansione e resistenza*. The minutes have been published in *La conversione al cristianesimo nell'Europa dell'alto Medioevo. Atti (dal 14 al 19 aprile 1966)*. Spoleto: Centro Italiano di Studi Sull'Alto Medioevo, 1967; *Cristianizzazione ed organizzazione ecclesiastica delle campagne nell'Alto Medioevo: Espansione e resistenza. Atti (dal 10 al 16 aprile 1980)*. Spoleto: Centro Italiano di Studi Sull'Alto Medioevo, 1982.

30. The accusation of heresy against the other was also reinforced with the addition of various vices. The history of vice/sin in the Middle Ages is partly the story of its instrumentalisation: the accusation of the doctrinal opponent of having incurred a series of moral deviations. For the case of the struggle between heretics and orthodoxies, see Mitre Fernández, Emilio. "Los pecados desde le herejía: la moral del otro en la Edad Media", *Pecar en la Edad Media*, Ana Isabel Carrasco Manchado, María del Pilar Rábade Obradó, eds. Madrid: Sílex, 2008: 281-296. This is a preview of a monograph which is currently being prepared.

31. Teillet, Suzanne. *Des Goths a la nation gothique. Les origines de l'idée de Nation en Occident du V^e au VI^e siècle*. Paris: Les Belles Lettres, 1984: 12, 25.



With the passing of time, these expressions took on a positive sense and referred to communities that were seen to display excellent, preferably spiritual, qualities. They contributed to giving shape and political structure to certain areas. This even led to changes in names: Transalpine Gaul became France (and the *regnum Francorum* became a *regnum Franciae* identified in the future with the territory of a nation-state),³² while the Cisalpine was, to a great extent, transformed into Lombardy, or the greater part of Britannia mutated into England.

In contrast, Paulo Orosio recalls an important gesture by the King Ataulf from the start of the fifth century. Convinced of the cultural backwardness of his Visigoths (Arians in those times, to be precise), he refused to change the name of Romania for Gothia and attempted to regenerate the dying forces of the latter with the vitality of the former.³³ Hispania would continue to be Hispania/Spain. This would be no obstacle for the notion of *regnum gothorum* to appear as a successor to the *regnum romanorum* in an epoch in which the concept of *respublica* disappeared to be replaced by the new nations.³⁴

The mythification of these *gentes* would be bigger than expected by who wondered a line of continuity whose origins were lost in the mists of time, and a capacity to overcome all kinds of vicissitudes. The beginnings of the Middle Ages played an important role in legitimation that the later historiography would only reinforce. The French, despite the succession of three different dynasties, created a solid image of continuity: the succession of their kings was great from the Trojans, founders of Paris.³⁵ This continuity was more problematic for the Spanish due to the fall of the promising Gothic monarchy and the caesura produced by the Islamic invasion. Or for the English, who experienced important dynastic changes with successive migratory waves.

However, one tendency would attempt to impose itself through the national histories: the absence of a solution of continuity in the trajectory of the different countries. This rested on a base: national identity absorbed by dynastic identity.³⁶

With the exaltation of the doctrinal orthodoxy, we can talk about two models for the west as a whole.

32. Teillet, Suzanne. *Des Goths à la nation gothique...*: 420.

33. Orosius. *Historias*, ed. Eustaquio Sánchez Salor. Madrid: Gredos, 1982: 279 (II, VII, chapter 43). In contrast with the negative views of the barbarians in the Roman historiography until the Late Empire, Paulus Orosius opened the way for a dignification of the Goths. Teillet, Suzanne. *Des Goths à la nation gothique...*: 113 and following.

34. Teillet, Suzanne. *Des Goths à la nation gothique...*: 536.

35. Guenée, Bernard. "Histoire d'un succès", *Les Grandes Chroniques de France. Les miniatures de Fouquet*, eds. François Avril, Marie Thérèse Gousset, Bernard Guenée. Paris: Philippe Lebaud, 1987: 118-119.

36. What Jean Marie Moeglin called the "Bavarian model" identified with the Wittelsbach dynasty (national, or if one likes, regional, model) would, in his view, apart from the various myths, be the one imposed in France. Moeglin, Jean Marie. "Nation et nationalisme du Moyen Âge à l'époque moderne (France-Allemagne)". *Revue Historique*, 611 (1999): 548-549.



2.2 The purity of 'genetic' faith: a people free of any stain

Such a characteristic possibly only occurred in one case that was however enormously representative for all the West: that of the Franks. As stated in the prologue to the Salic Law, they are

*L'illustre tribu (gens) des Francs, créé par Dieu, courageuse à la guerre, fidèle à ses engagements en temps de paix, sage dans ses décisions, de race noble, saine de nature, blanche de peau, superbe de corps, hardie, prompte et tenace, convertie à la foi catholique, pure de toute hérésie [...] Telle est la nation qui secoue le lourd joug des Romains grâce à son courage et à sa ténacité.*³⁷

Replacing Gauls with the Franks (where did ones end and the others begin?) the bishop and historian Gregory of Tours (538-594) echoed a tradition based on the apostolic dimension of the Gauls evangelised by seven bishops ordained by Saint Peter: Gatien of Tours, Trophimus of Arles, Paul of Narbonne, Saturnin of Toulouse, Denis of Paris, Austromoine of Clermont and Martial of Limoges.³⁸ At the end of the tenth century, the monk Richer lavished great praise on the Gauls.

*Bien que tous ces peuples fussent originellement barbares, l'histoire rapporte qu'ils ont presque toujours été heureux dans leurs entreprises depuis l'antiquité, même quand ils étaient encore païens. Baptisés ensuite par saint Remi, ils se sont signalés dès leur conversion par une victoire éclatante et célèbre. Leur premier roi chrétien fut, dit-on, Clovis. Après lui leur État a été gouverné par une suite d'empereurs éminents jusqu'à Charles dont le règne marquera le point de départ de notre histoire.*³⁹

This purity of faith would justify a kind of "manifest destiny" identified with the building of a state. This would take shape thanks to the ongoing impulse to unite the North —quintessential Frank— with a Midi was frequently home to people who were unreliable politically, spiritually and morally. The figures of Clovis, Charlemagne or Louis IX would symbolise the three lines of Frankish kings —

37. "The illustrious tribe (*gens*) of the Franks, created by God, valiant in war, loyal to agreements during the peace, prudent in decisions, of noble race, healthy by nature, white of skin, proud of body, valiant, speedy and tenacious, converted to the Catholic faith, clear of all heresy [...] this is the nation that shook of the heavy yoke of the Romans thanks to their bravery and tenacity". Prologue to the *Lex Salica* in Fichtenau, Henri. *L'empire carolingien*. Paris: Payot, 1981: 27.

38. Gregoire de Tours. *Histoire des francs*, ed. Robert Latouche. Paris: Les Belles Lettres, 1963: I, 55.

39. "Although all the peoples were originally barbarians, history recalls that the Gauls have been happy since Antiquity, even when they were still pagans. Baptised by Saint Remigius, they have distinguished themselves since their conversion with a striking and celebrated victory. Their first Christian king is said to be Clovis. The later have been governed by a series of eminent emperors until Charles (the simple) whose reign would mark the starting point for our history". Richer de Reims. *Histoire de France (889-995)*, ed. Robert Latouche. Paris: Les Belles Lettres, 1967: I, 11 (this is a bilingual version of a text —originally simply titled *Historiae*— in which the terms Gaul and Gauls are almost systematically transferred into modern French as France and the French).



Merovingians, Carolingians and Capets—defenders of the orthodoxy while also promoting the joining of these two fractions of modern-day France.⁴⁰

Gregory of Tours combined three items of his predecessors in the field of historiography in the Gaul of his epoch: The past as a question of immediacy and identity for the present; orthodoxy moulded into a kind of historiographic art and the Church and the State as its host in an important mixture.⁴¹ This is the declaration said to have been uttered by the Merovingian Clovis on the eve of his campaign against the Arian Visigoths of the Kingdom of Toulouse (507): *C'est avec beaucoup de peine que je supporte que ces Ariens occupent une partie des Gaules. Marchons avec l'aide de Dieu et quand ils auront été vaincus nous soumettrons leur terre à notre domination*.⁴² After some two centuries, the victory of the mayor of the palace, Charles Martel—root for the *deuxième* race of French monarchs—against the Moors at Poitiers (732) would create a myth: that of the saviour of the West from the enemies of the faith who threatened to swamp it.⁴³ His grandson Charles the Great (the Charlemagne of history and legend) has gone down in the most triumphalist history as a sort of father of Europe.⁴⁴

As *Saint Charlemagne*, he would be honoured by being raised to the altars of the Antipope Paschal III in 1166, a decision that enjoyed a certain popular acceptance, although it was not officially homologated. There was an imperialist ideology in favour of this peculiar canonisation: the Holy Empire could have a saint among its holders who would act as a go-between before the Almighty.⁴⁵ However, the exaltation of Charlemagne also served the interests of a Frankish power that, apart from repulsing Islam, had defended Southern France from the infiltration of the adoptionist heresy from the other side of the Pyrenees.⁴⁶

40. A study of the imaginary medieval French from medieval roots can be followed in the interesting work by Beaune, Colette. *Naissance de la nation France*. Paris: Gallimard, 1985.

41. Mitchell, Kathleen A. *History and Christian society in sixth-Century Gaul: an historiographical Analysis of Gregory of Tours "Decem Libri Historiarum"*. East Lansing: Michigan State University (PhD Dissertation), 1983: 57.

42. "Only with great sorrow can I support the Arians occupying part of Gaul. We march with the help of God and when we have overcome, their land will be subjected to our domination". Gregoire de Tours. *Histoire des francs...*: I, 129.

43. About this struggle, see Mitre Fernández, Emilio. "732, mito nacional francés. La victoria del martillo". *La aventura de la Historia*, 169 (2012): 41-44.

44. Some reflections about this theme can be found in Isla Frez, Amancio. "Los orígenes de la idea de Europa y Carlomagno", *Europa: proyecciones y percepciones históricas*, Ángel Vaca Lorenzo, ed. Salamanca: Universidad de Salamanca, 1997: 17-30.

45. It had it in another emperor—Henry II canonised in 1146 by Pope Eugene III—whose childless marriage to the Empress Cunegunda became a sort of exaltation of the principle of chastity. Duby, Georges. *El caballero, la mujer y el cura*. Madrid: Taurus, 1982: 51 and following. For the myth of Charlemagne throughout history and very especially in the medieval centuries, the monographic study by Folz, Robert. *Le souvenir et la légende de Charlemagne dans l'empire germanique*. Paris: Les Belles Lettres, 1950 is still useful. By the same author and of interest for the theme, see Folz, Robert. *Les rois saints du Moyen Âge en occident (VI^e-XIII^e siècles)*. Brussels: Société des Bollandistes, 1984.

46. For the historical evolution and peculiarities of the Midi of modern-day France at the start of the Medioevo, there is an excellent monographic study by Rouche, Michel. *L'Aquitaine des wisigoths aux arabes. 418-781. Naissance d'une région*. Paris: Éditions de l'École des hautes études en sciences sociales, 1979. For



Some Capet kings, the *troisième race* of French monarchs, also enjoyed a particular aura. Especially Louis IX (Saint Louis after his canonisation in 1297) synthesis of the *prudhomme* and Christian knight and personification of the ministerial sanctity, as his bio-hagiographer Jean de Joinville presented him.⁴⁷ The religious purity of this royal lineage and its policies would lead to the struggles by his ancestors against the Arians or Muslims being prolonged in the fight against the Cathars. The French Midi again becoming a battlefield in defence of orthodoxy against the error and ended up converting this duality of lands into a recurrent theme: those of the language of Oil and those of the language of Oc.⁴⁸

The Chronicle of France, which was drafted in French on instructions from Louis IX and finished in 1274 by the monk Primat, was illustrated with miniatures by Fouquet around 1459. The miracles of God and the protection of Saint Denis are complemented with a collective protagonist, which is the kingdom of France, and the Franks who inhabit it. A circumstance is noted from an early date: the victory at Tolbiac in 496 against the Alemanni was granted by “divine ordinance” not so much by King Clovis as *au roi et aus François*.⁴⁹

According an idealised vision, the name *franco* —in its highest sense— designated a kind of chosen people, a sort of substitute for the old Israel. On this base, the figure of the *gesta Dei per francos* would be created as an expression of the crusades, the first great collective enterprise by the West.⁵⁰

The self-esteem of the French monarchs as defenders of the purity of the faith led them into serious confrontation even with the pontificate that, in a way, reproduced the clashes that had occurred between the papacy and empire during the War of the Investitures. Extremely serious was the very well-known one that happened around 1300: against Boniface VIII, Phillip IV made use of a group of legal counsellors

the adoptionist heresy and what interests us here, a leading work is still the one by Abadal, Ramon d'. *La batalla del adopcionismo en la desintegración de la Iglesia visigoda*. Barcelona: Real Academia de Buenas Letras, 1949.

47. Full of originality is the biography about him written in recent times by Le Goff, Jacques. *Saint Louis*. Paris: Gallimard, 1996.

48. About the North-South confrontation in the fight against Catharism, there is an abundant bibliography full of numerous novelesque recreations. With a purely essayistic sense but maintaining the minimum levels of historical rigor, see Madaule, Jacques. *Le drame albigeois et l'unité française*. Paris: Gallimard, 1973. Much more up to date and excellently documented is the monographic work by Alvira, Martín. *12 de septiembre de 1213. El jueves de Muret*. Barcelona: Universitat de Barcelona, 2002. Among the more recent and complete works on Catharism in its various facets, it is worth highlighting the one by Jiménez Sánchez, Pilar. *Les catharismes. Modèles dissidents du christianisme médiéval (XII^e-XIII^e siècles)*. Rennes: Presses universitaires de Rennes, 2008.

49. Guenée, Bernard. “Histoire d'un succès...”: 109. The protagonism would shrink in the Late Medievo to a much closer circle: the king, his relatives, his barons and the palace officials. Guenée, Bernard. “Histoire d'un succès...”: 121.

50. The ninth centenary of the beginning of the crusades gave rise to a large number of scientific meetings and a large bibliographic output that was added to the existing rich bibliography. In the ideological and mental aspect of the phenomenon, Dupront published his monumental Dupront, Alphonse. *Le mythe de la croisade*. Paris: Gallimard, 1997. Flori is the author of an interesting book Flori, Jean. *La guerra santa. La formación de la idea de cruzada en el Occidente cristiano*. Madrid: Trotta, 2003. An updated panorama for Spain is provided by the useful summary by Ayala, Carlos de. *Las cruzadas*. Madrid: Sílex, 2004.



who backed a certain modern notion of the state and were also responsible for an important chapter in the history of political propaganda.⁵¹ From the royal circles, an authoritarian pope was accused of easily forgetting a fact: the Kingdom of France had always been in the vanguard of orthodoxy and had repeatedly sacrificed itself for the interests of the Holy See in defence of Christianity. This had reached the extreme that some of the kings had risked, or even lost, their lives in crusading style operations.⁵² In this case, it was not a case of reinforcing the religious identity of a state against that of the neighbour, but rather against the supreme authority of the Church culminating in a risky *tour de force*: the outrage at Anagni and the threat of opening a process against the pontiff placed him in a disagreeable situation.⁵³

2.3 A purity of faith sullied (or lost) and later recovered

From the fifth century and in various countries in the West, a very similar situation arose. The Arianism of some Germanic peoples (with their royal lineages in the front) meant an intermediate step between paganism and the ultimate acceptance of the Nicene faith. Faith rose to an authentic state religion, as we would call it nowadays.

2.3.1 The Hispanic case

In Spain, as in other places in Europe, a set of traditions that talked about its early evangelisation was strengthened: The passage in one of the Pauline Epistles (Rom. 15,24), the mythical presence of Santiago or the tradition (similar to the one in Gaul) of Seven Apostolic Men consecrated in Rome by Saint Peter and Saint

51. This dramatic clash has been the subject of abundant bibliography. A useful, though antiquated, dossier is the one by Wood, Charles, ed. *Felipe el Hermoso y Bonifacio VIII*. Mexico D.F.: Uthea, 1968. Useful for the figure of the French king is the biography by Favier, Jean. *Philippe le Bel*. Paris: Fayard, 1978. By the same author and for the monarch's collaborators, see Favier, Jean. "Les legistes et le gouvernement de Philippe le Bel". *Journal des savants*, 2 (1969): 92-118. A recent biography about this pontiff is Paravicini Bagliani, Agostino. *Boniface VIII: un pape hérétique?* Paris: Payot, 2003. About the effects of propaganda at that time, see Nieto Soria, José Manuel. "La propaganda política de la teocracia pontificia a las monarquías soberanas", *Propaganda y opinión pública en la Historia*, José Manuel Nieto Soria, Luis Miguel Enciso Recio, Jean François Botrel, Alejandro Pizarroso Quintero, Amalia Sánchez Sampedro, eds. Valladolid: Universidad de Valladolid, 2007: 31-32.

52. The one undertaken by Louis IX against Tunis in 1270 and the expedition under the banner of the crusade by his son and heir, Phillip III, against the Crown of Aragon (1285) whose monarch, Peter III, had been excommunicated.

53. The feeling of superiority of a prince over a pope considered unworthy can be appreciated in a letter sent by Henry IV to Gregory VII in 1076 in which, invectives aside, the monarch considered himself anxious to "preserve the honour of the Apostolic See" which, it was supposed, the papacy had sullied. See the anthology by Gallego Blanco, Enrique. *Relaciones entre la Iglesia y el Estado en la Edad Media*. Madrid: Revista de Occidente, 1973: 149.



Paul and contained in some Mozarab calendars: Torquatus, Secundius, Indaletius, Ctesiphon, Euphrasius, Caecilius and Hesychius.⁵⁴

The entry of the Suebi, Vandals and Alans into the Peninsula was presented by the bishop and chronicler Hydatius of Aquae Flaviae (actual Chaves) in apocalyptic terms: the plagues of the sword, hunger, pestilence and wild beasts lording it over Spain.⁵⁵ The *arraigada perfidia de los suevos*⁵⁶ oscillating between paganism and Arianism and preying on the Gallaecia region, was especially highlighted by the prelate. The entry of the Visigoths, theoretically federated to the Empire, in Hispania would add another element of complexity to the already convoluted political game. Although very slowly, the Visigoth monarchs would gradually become identified with a kind of guarantee of stability. Hence, this may seem a calculated ambiguity towards them by the chronicler of the time.

Especially striking for the Hispano-Roman episcopacy was it would end up being this religious duality that took shape: a *fides romana* (Nicene orthodoxy as the Hispano-Roman province rulers own creed) and a *fides gothica* —Arianism—a characteristic of the ruling political minority. Despite the tensions prior to the abjuration of heresy by the Visigoth monarchy,⁵⁷ it is necessary to recall what would be the more official view of this dichotomy, that which recognised the original and ingrained virtues of the *gens gothorum* and that, while it had been temporarily led to heresy, this was only the fault of a few wayward doctors. This is what Saint Leander pronounced before Reccared and his court.⁵⁸ From that date on, orthodoxy ended up being strictly militant in some Visigoth monarchs, like Sisebut, a sovereign with theological airs, who encouraged the Lombards (last bastion of Germanic Arianism) to take a step towards Catholicism.⁵⁹

Saint Isidore was author of a *Laus Hispaniae*, a kind of prologue to his most important historical work, taken exaggeratedly as an expression of a heartfelt Spanish proto-patriotism. There is however, another fragment of the *hispalense* in

54. García de Valdeavellano, Luis. *Historia de España I. De los orígenes a la baja Edad Media*. Madrid: Revista de Occidente, 1963: 243-244.

55. Hydatius. *Idacio, obispo de Chaves. Su Cronicón*, ed. Julio Campos. Salamanca: Ediciones Calasancias, 1984: 57-59.

56. “ingrained perfidy of the Suebi”. Hydatius. *Idacio, obispo de Chaves...*: 113.

57. Among other works on this, see Thompson, Edward A. “The conversion of the Visigoths to Catholicism”. *Nottingham Medieval Studies*, 4 (1960): 4-35; Fontaine, Jacques. “Conversion et culture chez les wisigoths d’Espagne”. *La conversione al cristianesimo nell’Europa dell’alto Medioevo. Atti (dal 14 al 19 aprile 1966)*. Spoleto: Centro Italiano di Studi Sull’Alto Medioevo, 1967: 87-147; and the much more recent one by García Moreno, Luis. *Leovigildo. Unidad y diversidad de un reinado*. Madrid: Real Academia de la Historia, 2008. It has been emphasised that the deeply Catholic Gregory of Tours did not appear hostile to the Arian Liuvigild who he backed in his confrontation with his rebel son, the Catholic Hermenegild. Teillet, Suzanne. *Des Goths a la nation...*: 384.

58. “Concilio de Toledo III”, *Concilios visigóticos e hispano-romanos*, Vives, José; Marín, Tomás; Martínez Díez, Gonzalo, eds. Madrid: Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas-Instituto Enrique Flórez, 1963: 110.

59. Cited in Mitre Fernández, Emilio. *Iglesia, herejía y vida política...*: 41.



this same work,⁶⁰ that should not go unnoticed: it refers to the expulsion of the last Byzantine garrisons in the Peninsula by Suintila (621). This Visigoth king, apart from his virtues, would be *quien por primera vez logró establecer la monarquía sobre todo Hispania de más acá del océano*.⁶¹ The authority of a royal lineage thus became identified with a territory with well-defined limits and compactly Catholic as was shown later with the measures against the Jews, the last religious community in the Peninsula outwith the norms of Nicenism.⁶²

The Islamic invasion of 711 that ended the Hispano-Gothic kingdom of Toledo, the “loss of Spain” or “the ruin of Spain”,⁶³ gave rise to a new game of identity-otherness. From the Hispano-Christian states, a double image abounded. The followers of Islam were perceived as “barbarians” in line with an early tradition in the Iberian world,⁶⁴ and the Muslim faith was equated with a heresy, a mixture of heresies or, at least, presented as a danger similar to the various doctrinal errors that had placed the unity of the Church at risk throughout its history.⁶⁵

The long process that we know as the Reconquest, often the subject of heated debate among historians, was, for the Christian monarchs, like a great project to restore an old order fractured by the Muslim presence in the Peninsula.⁶⁶ It is significant that, on the Christian conquest of the Hispano-Muslim cities, there was an immediate conversion of the great mosque into a cathedral. This *limpieza de la*

60. Isidoro de Sevilla. *Las historias de los godos, vándalos y suevos de Isidoro de Sevilla*, ed. Cristóbal Rodríguez Alonso. León: Centro de Estudios e Investigación San Isidoro, 1975.

61. “who first managed to establish a monarchy over all Hispania on this side of the ocean”. There is an evaluation of these questions (*Mater Spania*) in Fontaine, Jacques. *Isidoro de Sevilla. Génesis y originalidad de la cultura hispánica en tiempos de los visigodos*. Madrid: Encuentro, 2002: 271-286.

62. Among other works on this theme, see the one by González Salinero, Raúl. *Las conversiones forzadas de los judíos en el reino visigodo*. Rome: Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas-Escuela Española de Historia y Arqueología en Roma, 2000.

63. About this figure, see Martín Rodríguez, José Luis. “La pérdida y la reconquista de España a la luz de las Crónicas y del Romancero”, *Repoblación y reconquista. Actas del III Curso de Cultura Medieval*. (Aguilar de Campoo. Septiembre 1991), José Luis Hernando Garrido, Miguel Ángel García Guinea, eds. Aguilar de Campoo: Centro de Estudios del Románico, 1993: 9-16.

64. Barkai, Ron. *Cristianos y musulmanes en la España medieval (El enemigo en el espejo)*. Madrid: Rialp, 1984: 135-136. The frequency with which the term “barbarian” is used to refer to Muslims in a Latin historical compilation from the mid-thirteenth century (the *Chronicon mundi*), the subject of various romance versions, has been highlighted. Lucas de Tuy. *Crónica de España. Primera edición del texto romanceado conforme a un códice de la Academia*, ed. Julio Puyol. Madrid: Revista de Archivos, Bibliotecas y Museos, 1926.

65. For this theme in relation to the founder, see Tolan, John Victor. “Muhammad Heresiarch (Twelfth Century)”, *Saracens, Islam in the Medieval European Imagination*, John Victor Tolan, ed. New York: Columbia University Press, 2002: 135-169. About the recurrences of this image of Islam-heresy, see Mitre Fernández, Emilio. “Otras religiones ¿Otras herejías? (El mundo mediterráneo ante el ‘choque de civilizaciones’ en el Medioevo)”. *En la España Medieval*, 25 (2002): 9-45, especially 25-30. This article in turn was included in the compilation cited in note 1: Mitre Fernández, Emilio. *Los credos medievales...*: 17-81. An assimilation that began at an early date and still persisted towards the end of the Medioevo with personalities of the stature of Cardinal Juan de Torquemada.

66. About this play on Reconquest/Restoration in the authors in the Middle Ages and beginning of the Contemporary age, see the interesting study by Ríos, Martín Federico. *La Reconquista. Una construcción historiográfica (siglos XVI-XIX)*. Madrid: Marcial Pons, 2011.



suciedad de Mahoma meant the *recuperación de una pureza original profanada por los musulmanes*.⁶⁷

The Gothic myth would make its royal line (especially the figure of Reccared) into a stamp of glory. The crown of Castile would be particularly receptive to this tradition, considered of singular importance for forging a Hispanic political personality.⁶⁸ To this myth, the Roman one was also added, which was accepted to a greater or lesser extent by various authors in the Medievo.⁶⁹ At the end of the fifteenth century, Joan Margarit, bishop of Girona and historian, presented the marriage of Isabella and Ferdinand as a reconstruction of the unity of the old Roman circumscriptions of the Citerior and the Ulterior.⁷⁰

2.3.2 *The Anglo-Saxon world and its legacy*

According to Walter Goffart, at the start of the Medievo, Great Britain had the special fortune of having a historian of the stature of the Venerable Bede. He was the first with an authentically national status if we ignore the figure of Jordanes, who was also like this but in a very different sense.⁷¹ Bede, in fact, tells us about a (some) people(s) identified with a perfectly defined geographic setting.⁷² Angles, Jutes and Saxons evolved into a homogeneous *gens anglorum*, following the example of Pope Gregory the Great, the great promoter (via Augustine of Canterbury in 596) of their Christianisation under the banner of Romanism.⁷³

This process was not always easy. It came up against the resistance of a persistent paganism, especially in its stronghold in the Kingdom of Mercia until 653, when its king Peada, son of the pagan Penda “accepted the true faith and its sacraments”.⁷⁴ It also clashed with certain Celtic liturgical peculiarities that, tendentially by

67. “Cleaning the filth of Mohammed” and “recovery of an original purity desecrated by the Muslims”. García Fitz, Francisco. *La Reconquista*. Granada: Universidad de Granada, 2010: 145.

68. For these traditions, see two works of notable interest. The book by Maravall, José Antonio. *El concepto de España en la Edad Media*. Madrid: Centro de Estudios Constitucionales, 1981; and the essay by Catalán, Diego. “España en su historiografía: de objeto a sujeto de la historia”, *Los españoles en la historia*, Ramón Menéndez Pidal, Diego Catalán, eds. Madrid: Espasa Calpe, 1982: 9-67, especially 16-30.

69. It has been highlighted, for example, that Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada gave such little importance to the presence of Rome in Hispania (only a few lines in Jiménez de Rada, Rodrigo. *Historia de los hechos de España*, ed. Juan Fernández Valverde. Madrid: Alianza Editorial, 1989, in contrast with the wide coverage—over three hundred chapters—given to it in Alfonso X, *Primera crónica General de España*, ed. Ramón Menéndez Pidal. Madrid: Gredos, 1979).

70. Tate, Robert B. *Ensayos sobre historiografía peninsular del siglo XV*. Madrid: Gredos, 1970: 149.

71. See the study on historiography of the very early Middle Ages by Goffart, Walter. *The narrators of Barbarian History (AD 550-800)*. Jordanes, Gregory of Tours, Bede and Paul the Deacon. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1988.

72. A Britannia which Bede reminded of its limits in the first pages of his historical-national work: Bede. *A History of the English Church and People*, ed. Leo Shirley Rice. London: Penguin, 1968: 37. With this he advises us about the area where the action will take place.

73. Bede. *A History of the English Church...*: 94-105.

74. Bede. *A History of the English Church...*: 176.



the Church, became assimilated ethnically with heresy: this was the case of the different date for Easter to the one imposed in the Council of Nicaea. More serious theologically would be the case of the Pelagianism also considered as a negative Breton identity trait (due to the geographic origins of its promoter)⁷⁵ according to the guardians of orthodoxy.⁷⁶

The defeat (at least official) of liturgical Celtism⁷⁷ converted Britannia into a kind of new Promised Land for the Angles and Saxons, now converted and responsible for their sins like, in their time, the Israelites were for theirs.⁷⁸ Bede's work summarised national history and ecclesiastic history, accepting (as Gregory of Tours and all the historiography of the High Medioevo also did) the ideological assumptions of the providentialist *historia ecclesiastica* popularised from the fourth century by Eusebius of Caesarea.⁷⁹

Later historians continued to take the emergence of new peoples in the islands (the Danes and in then, the Normans from the other side of the Channel) as a sort of divine punishment for the infidelities of a people.⁸⁰ Thus, the arrival of William the Conqueror in 1066 and the establishment of a new political power would be the result of the perjury by the last monarch of the Anglo-Saxon line —Harold— who, against all legitimacy, had seized the crown of England, according to a chronicler of the Middle Ages from a Norman family.⁸¹ Despite setbacks to his policies, the great architect of the so-called Plantagenet (or Angevine) Empire, Henry II would be a reliably king of his own propaganda. Artistic and literary manifestations present his dynasty under a very favourable prism, among other reasons, as a fighter against the “barbarian” Welsh, Irish and Saracens.⁸²

75. A Breton, although his main intellectual activity was in the Mediterranean world, where he had a strong opponent in Saint Augustine. Among other studies, see the highly appreciated one by Rees, Brinley Roderick. *Pelagius. A Reluctant heretic*. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 1989.

76. For this theme, see Isla Frez, Amancio. “El desarrollo del pelagianismo y la cristianización de Inglaterra”, *De Constantino a Carlomagno: disidentes, heterodoxos, marginados*, Francisco Javier Lomas, Federico Devís, eds. Cádiz: Universidad de Cádiz, 1992: 197-210.

77. Bede. *A History of the English Church...*: 328, referring to the adoption by the monks of Iona of the Roman Paschal dating in 716.

78. Brown, Peter. *El primer milenio de la cristiandad...*: 185.

79. Markus, Robert Austin. *Bede and the Tradition of Ecclesiastical historiography*. Jarrow: St. Paul's Rectory, 1975.

80. Following the tradition of the monk Gildas, who wrote a *De Excidio et conquestu Britanniae* in the sixth century describing the ruin of the country at the hands of the barbarian invaders.

81. Henry of Huntingdon. *The History of the English People. 1000-1154*, ed. Diana Greenway. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002: 24. As a counterpart, another writer, Eadmer of Canterbury (who died around 1144), a disciple of Saint Anselm, presented his affection for the Anglo-Saxon world, taking the Normans as the enemies of his people. See the references to English historiography in Heer, Friedrich. *El mundo medieval. Europa 1100-1350*. Madrid: Guadarrama, 1963: 305-307.

82. Aurell, Martin. *El imperio Plantagenet (1154-1224)*. Madrid: Sílex, 2012: 140-155.



2.3.3 Italy: from the Ostrogoths to the Lombards and their legacy

The dethroning of the last Western emperor (Romulus Augustulus) in 476 left Italy at the mercy of successive avatars. These began with a brief reign by the Herulian Odoacer, and continued with the government of the Ostrogoths of Theoderic the Great (493-526). In his *Chronica*, the scholar Cassiodorus Senator, Theoderic's *Magister officiorum*, would inspire a kind of Roman-Gothic ideology by including his monarch in the succession of the emperors.⁸³ Then, in *De origine actibusque Getarum* (c. 551), the obscure historian Jordanes would claim that Theoderic's authority spread, either by force or by friendship, to all the kingdoms of the West.⁸⁴

Such promising perspectives were frustrated with the "reconquest" of Italy by Justinian after a gruelling war of attrition. With the *Pragmática sanctio* of 554, the restoration of the direct imperial rule in the Peninsula was taken for granted, but the operation degenerated into an authentic *fiasco*⁸⁵ as the destruction of the Ostrogoths opened the way in Italy for a scantily Romanised, while also sincerely Arian people: the Lombards. Italy ended up divided into two fractions: a *pars romana*, ever smaller and subject to the emperors of Constantinople through his representative, the Exarchate resident in Ravenna; and a *pars longobarda*, a set of duchies with little cohesion.⁸⁶

Even the "national" historian of the Lombards, Paul the Deacon, had difficulties (in contrast to other historical narratives) to show their conversion to Catholic orthodoxy up, a confusing process riddled with ups and downs. The furthest he went was to exalt the figure of King Liutprand who definitively ruled as a Catholic: *hombre de gran sabiduría, juicio sagaz, muy piadoso, amante de la paz, poderoso en la guerra, clemente con los criminales, casto, púdico, incansable orando, generoso en las limosnas*.⁸⁷ It has been recognised that the amalgam between Romans and Lombards did not lead to the disappearance of the identity of the latter. In the eighth century, the members of the social elite considered themselves Lombards beyond considerations biological.⁸⁸ This is in contrast with the perception of another author who years ago talked about the "tragedy of the Lombards": their inability to give Italy the needed

83. Teillet, Suzanne. *Des Goths a la nation gothique...*: 281.

84. Jordanes. *Origen y gestas de los godos*, ed. José María Sánchez Martín. Madrid: Cátedra, 2001: 228.

85. *Justiniano fue el último emperador romano en el trono imperial bizantino* ("Justinian was the last Roman emperor on the Byzantine imperial throne"), as the historian Georg Ostrogorsky stated categorically years ago in Ostrogorsky, Georg. *Historia del estado bizantino*, trans. Javier Faci. Madrid: Akal, 1984: 90 (on the 1963 German edition). Justinian's was a universalist and megalomaniac policy that (following the *Historia Secreta* by Procopius of Caesarea) ended up ruining the State. Ahrweiler, Hélène. *L'ideologie politique de l'empire byzantin*. Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 1975: 21.

86. An adequate resume of these vicisitudes can be found in Capitani, Ovidio. *Storia dell'Italia medievale*. Bari: Laterza, 1989: 27-43.

87. "man of great wisdom, wise judgment, very pious, peace-loving, mighty in war, lenient toward criminals, chaste, modest, untiring in prayer, generous with alms". Paulus Diaconus. *Historia de los longobardos*, ed. Pedro Herrera Roldán. Cádiz: Servicio de Publicaciones de la Universidad de Cádiz, 2006: 219-20.

88. Geary, Patrick. *Quand les nations refont l'histoire...*: 160.



political unity. That would facilitate their defeat by the Franks and the dethroning of their last national monarch by Charlemagne.⁸⁹

That misfortune would be remedied by a certain official similarity in the Chancellery that was established between two peoples, by naming himself the great Carolingian *rex francorum et langobardorum* (and *patricium romanorum*) before his imperial coronation in 800.⁹⁰ The Lombard kingdom would derive into another, part of the trilogy of crowns (Germania-Burgundy-Italy) that gave the “legal epiphenomenon” that was the Holy Empire its character.⁹¹

2.3.4 The Saxons of Germania, quintessence of the Teutonic world

The Saxons had earned fame for the tenacity of their paganism, which Charlemagne had tamed after a ferocious war of conquest that, according to Einhard, lasted over thirty years.⁹² With time (from 962), we find a radical change: the Saxons would be converted—dynasty of the Ottonians—into receptors of imperial dignity.⁹³

The monk and historian Widukind of Corvey, descendent of the hero of the anti-Carolingian resistance, described an idealised image of this people that would expurgate old traumas. He established a parallelism regarding the enemies defeated: the Franks finished off the Avars who had settled on the middle reaches of the Danube, and at the Battle of Lechfeld (955), the Saxons put an end to the annual raids by the Magyars, supposedly their brother race, and which had been a nightmare for Europe in the first half of the tenth century.⁹⁴

The emperor considered most Romanist among the early Ottonians (Otto III) would symbolise German pride in the heading of his diplomas by identified himself with the Saxon, *Moi, Othon, Romain, Saxon et Italien, serviteur des apôtres, par la grâce divine empereur auguste du monde*.⁹⁵ Eneas Silvio Piccolomini would again recall this association of the Saxon people with the Christian empire at the end of the Medioevo when he evoked the *discreción exquisita y la grandeza de sus realizaciones* of the first three monarchs who earned *muchos méritos ante la Iglesia Romana y no me caben dudas de que gracias a ellos se ensancharon las fronteras de Sajonia*.⁹⁶

89. López, Roberto S. *El nacimiento de Europa*. Barcelona: Labor, 1965: 95-96.

90. Folz, Robert. *Le couronnement imperial...*: 207.

91. Noël, Jean François. *Le Saint-Empire...*: 17 and following.

92. Eginhard. *Vida de Carlomagno*, ed. Alejandra de Riquer. Barcelona: Promociones y Publicaciones Universitarias, 1986: 61. Still under Charles' grandson, Louis the German, the eastern Frankish authorities had to face a serious paganising rebellion known as the Stellinga.

93. For the grafting of the Franks and Saxons onto the Ottonian Empire, see Beumann, Helmut. “Sachsen und Franjen im Werdenden Regnum Teutonicum”, *Angli e sassoni al di qua e al di là del mare*. Spoleto: Centro Italiano di Studi Sull'Alto Medioevo, 1986: 885-912.

94. Folz, Robert. *Le souvenir...*: 54-55.

95. “I, Otto, Roman, Saxon and Italian, server of the apostles, by the grace of God, august emperor of the world”. Chelini, Jean. *Histoire religieuse de l'Occident médiéval*. Paris: Armand Colin, 1968: 189.

96. “exquisite discretion and grandeur of their actions” and “many merits before the Roman Church and I have no doubt that thanks to these, the frontiers of Saxony were extended”. Piccolomini, Enea Silvio.



Over the centuries, it was thought that the *imperium*, the maximum symbol of political power, should be legitimately wielded by the Germans, whether these were Saxons or Franconians, Salians or Hapsburgs. To the same extent, according to the canon of Cologne, Alexander of Roes, (end of the thirteenth century) the highest level of the *sacerdotium* (the papacy) should correspond to the Italians; or the *studium* (intellectual power) to the French, in virtue of the prestige acquired by the University of Paris.⁹⁷

2.4 The general survival of extra-Christian elements

S. Teillet has highlighted that with Gregory the Great (590-604), the barbarian *nationes* acquired recognition of their personality in a similar degree to the Empire with his court in Constantinople.⁹⁸ It is not by chance that this pontiff has been considered the first authentically medieval pope. The anointment received by the monarchs of some countries earned them extra legitimacy by granting them a semi-sacerdotal status.⁹⁹

All this did not avoid that, in countries that had become officially Christian-Catholics, old pagan traditions of identity persisted throughout the Medioevo and even beyond its chronological limits. The myth of the defeated Trojans exerted a particular attraction.¹⁰⁰ Princes of this origin scattered after the fall of their city would play a significant role in the genealogy of various European countries: Aeneas for the Romans,¹⁰¹ Pharamond for the Franks,¹⁰² and Brutus for the Britons.¹⁰³ A significant claim is place in the mouth of Julius Caesar: *esos britanos y nosotros*,

La Europa de mi tiempo, ed. Francisco Socas. Seville: Universidad de Sevilla-Secretariado de Publicaciones, 1998: 136-137.

97. See Murray, Alexander. *Razón y sociedad en la Edad Media*. Madrid: Taurus, 1982: 317.

98. Teillet, Suzanne. *Des Goths a la nation gothique...*: 335 and following.

99. For this theme, the magistral work is still Bloch, Marc. *Les rois thaumaturges: étude sur le caractère surnaturel attribué à la puissance royale particulièrement en France et en Angleterre*. Paris: Gallimard, 1983. For Visigoth Spain, see Barbero, Abilio. "El pensamiento político visigodo y las primeras unciones regias en la Europa medieval". *Hispania*, 30 (1970): 245-326.

100. Menéndez Pidal dates the interest of the Spanish scholars in the theme back to the eleventh century. The *Historia Troyana* would be a translation of the *Roman de Troie* by Benoit de Sainte Maure. Menéndez Pidal, Ramón. *Historia Troyana en prosa y verso. Texto de hacia 1270*. Madrid: Imprenta de S. Aguirre, 1934: 7-10.

101. See the beautiful passage in Virgil, *Eneida*, book 8, where the shield forged by Vulcan for Aeneas was engraved with the glorious episodes that awaited in the history of Rome, capped by the victory of Octavian in Actium. Virgilio. *Obras completas de Virgilio*, ed. Lorenzo Riber. Madrid: Aguilar, 1934: 429-432.

102. Fredegarius Scholasticus. "Fragmenta quae ad Historiam Francorum pertinent", *Patrologiae. Cursus completus*. Paris: Jacques-Paul Migne editorem, 1849: LXI, col. 697-699.

103. Geoffrey of Monmouth. *Historia de los reyes de Britania*, ed. Luis Alberto de Cuenca. Madrid: Siruela, 1984: 5.



*romanos, hemos nacido de la misma sangre.*¹⁰⁴ Nor was there an absolute rejection of the pagan pantheon, some of whose figures appear mixed in the genealogies of kings with those of the Old Testament. This was the case of Alfred the Great whose ancestors included figures like Woden and Geat (“who the pagans considered as a God”) with Seth and his father Adam.¹⁰⁵

The chronicles of the Hispanic kingdoms are riddled with mythological heroes. This was the case of Tubal, fifth son of Japhet *de quien descenden los iberos que también se llaman hispanos, según opinan Isidoro y Jerónimo* as Archbishop Jiménez de Rada recalled.¹⁰⁶ Lucas de Tuy, who refers to Saint Isidore, remembered the case of Ispán, first king of the Spanish, founder of Hispalis and from whom *también España traxo el nonbre*,¹⁰⁷ a legend found in the *Crónica de San Juan de la Peña*, written in the second half of the fourteenth century on orders from Peter the Ceremonious.¹⁰⁸ The traditions linked to the figure of Hercules in the creation of the Spanish history and shaping the internal map of Hispania also gave an extraordinary degree of unity.¹⁰⁹

In short, mythical characters from the classical world, conceived as human beings in the historiography of the Medievo and the Renaissance, would thus be exalted because of their contributions to humanity in general and a people in particular, in some cases even becoming their eponymous heroes.¹¹⁰ While the *filosofía* in its widest sense was *ancilla theologiae*, the mythology, duly instrumentalised, could also become an ancillary element for a political identity boasted purity of faith.

3. Identity through otherness: a negative view of the ‘other’

The excessive pride attributed to a people, proud of their superiority in front to the neighbours, could create broad mistrust. This would be, for example, the case

104. “these Britons and us, the Romans, have been born from the same blood”. Geoffrey of Monmouth. *Historia de los reyes...*: 53, invoking the parallelism of Aeneas and Brutus.

105. Alfred the Great. *Asser's Life of King Alfred and other contemporary sources*, eds. Simon Keynes, Michael Lapidge. London: Penguin, 1983: 67. For the genealogies of the insular royalty, see Broocke, Christopher. *The Saxon and Norman Kings*. London: Fontana-Collins, 1977: 73 and following.

106. “from whom the Iberians who are also called Hispanics are descended, according to the opinions of Isidore and Jerome.” Jiménez de Rada, Rodrigo. *Historia de los hechos de España...*: 64. See, among others, Príncipe de Viana. *La crónica de los Reyes de Navarra del Príncipe de Viana*, ed. Carmen Orcástegui Gros. Pamplona: Diputación de Navarra-Institución Príncipe de Viana-Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, 1978: 76.

107. “Spain also brought its name”. Lucas de Tuy. *Crónica de España...*: 151.

108. Carmen Orcástegui Gros, ed. *Crónica de San Juan de la Peña (Versión aragonesa)*. Zaragoza: Institución Fernando el Católico, 1986: 7

109. Jiménez de Rada, Rodrigo. *Historia de los hechos de España...*: 66-70.

110. For these components in general applied to a certain territory, especially between the 13th (Jiménez de Rada) and sixteenth centuries (Florián de Ocampo), see Tate, Robert B. “Mitología en la historiografía española”, *Ensayos sobre la historiografía peninsular del siglo XV*, Robert B. Tate, ed. Madrid: Gredos, 1970: 13-32.



of the French, associated with the *superbia gallicana*,¹¹¹ a circumstance that was even more serious given that pride was considered the worst of the vices, or at least, the root of all these.¹¹²

3.1 Otherness and religious faith: the centre and periphery of the West

The proliferation of heretical movements from the start of the second millennium¹¹³ gave new strength to the tendencies of political-religious identity in different countries in the West.

For some in Languedoc, its cities (Albi, Toulouse, Béziers or Narbonne) deserved the opinion as a land prone to heresy, hatred of the French from the North and generally tending towards bad faith.¹¹⁴ Italian cities like Milan, so famous for many reasons, also led the field with their defects: they were the *fovea haereticorum*.¹¹⁵ The “Lombards” (who, in some case, like the bankers of Asti, were Piedmontese) and the “Cahorsini”, appear as usurers, when usury was quite the antithesis of respectability.¹¹⁶ In the form of greed, it competed even with pride as a perversion. The city in general, as a field of experimentation in all kinds of innovations, ended up being seen by the more conservative minds with undisguised suspicion.¹¹⁷

A diffuse “internal” enemy was also facilitated by the places of origin of these *routiers*; soldiers of fortune identified with Biscayans, Aragoneses, Brabançons,

111. The thirteenth century Franciscan and chronicler, Fra Salimbene of Parma, accused the French of *superbisimi et crudelissimi*. Scivoletto, Nino. *Fra Salimbene de Parma e la storia politica e religiosa del secolo decimoterzo*. Bari: Laterza, 1950: 125.

112. Juan Casiano, one of the first to systemise the deadly vices stated that pride is the first among all the sins and the principle of all crimes. John Cassian. *Institutiones cenobitas*, ed. Mauro Matthei. Zamora: Ediciones Monte Casino, 2000: 257-260. About the deadly sins in the Middle Ages, see the excellent summary by Casagrande, Carla; Vecchio, Silvana. *I sette vizi capitali. Storia dei peccati nel Medioevo*. Turin: Giulio Einaudi, 2000.

113. Mitre Fernández, Emilio; Granda, Cristina. *Las grandes herejías de la Europa cristiana (380-1520)*. Madrid: Istmo, 1999: 53 and following.

114. As repeatedly expressed by the Cistercian chronicler Pierre des Vaux-de-Cernay. *Histoire albigeoise*, eds. Pascal Guebin, Henri Maisonneuve. Paris: J. Vrin, 1951. Many different authors echoed these particular roots of heresy in the Midi (defining its followers as Albigensian) even highlighting their confrontation with the “people of the Franks” identified with crusades from the North. Charlo Brea, Luis, ed. *Crónica Latina de los Reyes de Castilla*. Madrid: Akal, 1999: 39, 74. About the perception of Catharism over the centuries, see Vicaire, Marie-Humbert. *Historiographie du catharisme*. Toulouse: Privat, 1979; and Martel, Philippe. *Les cathares et l’histoire. Le drame cathare devant ses historiens (1820-1992)*. Toulouse: Privat, 2002.

115. “cave of heretics”. Volpe, Gioacchino. *Movimenti religiosi e sette ereticali nella società medievale italiana. Secoli XI-XIV*. Florence: Sansoni, 1971: 89.

116. For the casuistic around this subject, see the suggestive essay by Le Goff, Jacques. *La bolsa y la vida. Economía y religión en la Edad Media*. Barcelona: Gedisa, 1987. He has recently updated this analysis in Le Goff, Jacques. *La Edad Media y el dinero. Ensayo de antropología histórica*. Madrid: Akal, 2012.

117. A question dealt with in Mitre Fernández, Emilio. *La ciudad cristiana del occidente medieval (400-1500)*. San Sebastián de los Reyes: Actas, 2010.



Triaverdini and Cotarelli, who the Third Council of the Lateran (1179) considered comparable to heretics for the damage they caused to the assets of the Church.¹¹⁸

For the religious game of purity/impurity played with the ideas of schism, heresy, paganism, phylo-Judaism, etc. and also, the simple formal peculiarities or suspicion of twisted morality as this was appreciated from the hard core of Roman Christianity forged in the norms of Gregorianism.

The precautions taken against a *gens*, kingdom or country situated near another or on the periphery of Europe were more than anecdotic.

The same happened with Romanist reservations towards insular Celtic communities like the Irish —still poorly assimilated into the political and social guidelines of the West— whom a figure of the stature of Saint Bernard considered *Cristianos de nombre, pero paganos de hecho*. This implied that from a French, English or Italian mentality, their social order differed from the continental one.¹¹⁹

The Bulgars had a poor religious and moral image, associated with the Bogomil heresy considered the mother of the various Manichaeisms of the Medioevo. The demonym Bulgar —*bougre*— was applied as a synonym of Cathar in particular and heretic in general.¹²⁰ It even became related to the idea of homosexuality.¹²¹ The Balkan world in general would become suspected of “Manichaean” contamination. Thus, the Bosnians would be *mala ralea que consideran que hay dos principios en la realidad, el del bien y el del mal*,¹²² apart from disavowing the primacy of Rome, the consubstantiality of Father and Son, and their monks maintaining not very respectable habits.

The Bohemians, especially in the Germanic world, gained a particularly bad reputation when Juan Hus and his direct or indirect disciples made Bohemia an important focus of religious subversion towards the end of the Medioevo, and expelled the Germans from the University of Prague. Hus drew the attention of the nonconformists of half Europe¹²³ and the hatred of the other half. The neighbouring Moravia did not come out any better, its inhabitants considered a *raza fiera y amiga*

118. “Decretos del Tercer Concilio de Letrán”, *Lateranense I, II y III*, ed. Raimunda Foreville, trans. Juan Cruz Puente. Vitoria: Eset, 1972: 280.

119. “Christians in name but Pagans in reality”. Bartlett, Robert. *La formación de Europa. Conquista, civilización y cambio cultural, 950-1350*. Valencia: Universitat de València, 2003: 42.

120. Angelov, Dimitar. “Le bogomilisme. Envergure bulgare et europeenne”. *Heresis*, 19 (1992): 1-18. This complements a much longer text by the same author, in which he gives Bogomilism a social and national dimension as a sign of Bulgarian identity. Angelov, Dimitar. *Il bogomilismo. Un’eresia medievale bulgara*. Rome: Bulzoni, 1979.

121. *Bruggewrare, buziron, bugeron and bujarrón* (“homosexual”). Duvernoy, Jean. *La religion des cathares*. Toulouse: Privat, 1989: 310.

122. “bad ilk who believe that there are two principles in reality, good and evil”. Piccolomini, Enea Silvio. *La Europa de mi tiempo...*: 104-105.

123. The expression “international Waldo-Hussite” has been used by various specialists in our times to define diffuse currents of dissent that linked to the religious concerns of the beginnings of Modernity. Enea Silvio Piccolomini wrote a *Historia bohémica* that contributed powerfully to consolidating this bad image of the Czechs, also summarised in Piccolomini, Enea Silvio. *La Europa de mi tiempo...*: 147-148.



de latrocinios and its barons *casi todos contaminados por la herejía husita*.¹²⁴ An image that would contrast with the one the Bohemians had of themselves as defenders of a purity of faith against the corruption ecclesiastic assimilated with simony.¹²⁵ In Bohemia—under the pro-Hussite monarch George of Poděbrady—a project for European unity against the Turkish threat would even arise, but this was rejected by the papacy.¹²⁶

After Middle Ages, Miguel Servet would echo an opinion that was going round the continent: *Hungría proporciona el ganado, Baviera los cerdos, Franconia las cebollas y la remolacha, Suabia las prostitutas y Bohemia los herejes*.¹²⁷ In contrast, Hussism as a national myth (the Bohemians as a kind of chosen people according to the most exalted expression) would persist from Hus until Palacky, one of the great historians of the Czech world.¹²⁸

3.2 A singular Hispanic case?¹²⁹

At the end of the nineteenth century, Marcelino Menéndez Pelayo gave birth to a well-known and widely debated work¹³⁰ in which he mixed overwhelming erudition, patriotic ardour and profound Catholic militancy.¹³¹ Although he considered heresies (and among these especially Protestantism) foreign to the Spanish spirit, the abundance of religious discrepancies (real or supposed) reported

124. “fierce race and friend of robbers”, “almost all contaminated with the Hussite heresy”. Piccolomini, Enea Silvio. *La Europa de mi tiempo...*: 119.

125. For these relations between nation and national peculiarities in the Bohemia of that epoch, see, among others, the considerations by Smahel, Frantisek. *La revolución hussita, une anomalie historique*. Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 1985: 85-104.

126. Heymann, Frederick G. *George of Bohemia, King of Heretics*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1965: 193-213.

127. “Hungary supplies the livestock, Bavaria the pigs, Franconia the onions and beet, Swabia the prostitutes and Bohemia the heretics”. Macek, Joseph. *La revolución husita. Orígenes, desarrollo y consecuencias*. Madrid: Siglo XXI, 1975: 170.

128. Macek, Joseph. *La revolución husita...*: 267 and following.

129. See the appendix in Mitre Fernández, Emilio; Alvira Cabrer, Martín; Martínez Tur, José Emilio. “El debate ortodoxia-herejía y las relaciones franco-españolas en el Medievo (Conversación a tres: Emilio Mitre Fernández, Martín Alvira Cabrer y José Emilio Martínez Tur)”, *Iglesia, herejía y vida política en la Edad Media*, Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2007: 181-194.

130. Menéndez Pelayo, Marcelino. *Historia de los heterodoxos españoles*, whose plan appeared in 1876 and the first edition in three volumes between 1880 and 1882. The second, with the corresponding corrections and additions, dates from July 1910 (reproduction in Menéndez Pelayo, Marcelino. *Historia de los heterodoxos españoles*. Madrid: Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, 1992).

131. A circumstance that earned him glowing praise and sharp criticism from the most varied sectors. Among the latter, Josep Pla, who wrote *Como buen católico español Menéndez Pelayo resulta a menudo de un fanatismo indignante* (“as a good Spanish Catholic, Menéndez Pelayo was often of an indignant fanaticism”). Pla, Josep. *Dietarios (I) El cuaderno gris/Notas dispersas*. Madrid: Espasa, 2001: 644.



in the Iberian world created the impression of a territory perfectly homologous with the rest of Europe.¹³²

The fact that movements like Priscillianism, Arianism, Adoptionism, Islamic influences, various superstitions, etc, developed in the Peninsula allowed Pope Gregory VII to warn in 1074 about the serious spiritual dangers the Hispano-Christian kingdoms faced.¹³³

The particular liturgy known as Mozarab was considered fully orthodox by Pope John X around 924. However, with the years and the effect of the rigid uniformity imposed by Gregorianism, this was branded in certain sectors as a simple *superstitio toletana*.¹³⁴ When the Romans norms were finally imposed, there were various different reactions among the Hispanics. In some cases, they fuelled suspicion of opposing the *ley y costumbres romanas* with the *ley toledana*. When these were implanted, some said the *borradas por completo las tinieblas de la ignorancia (y) empezaron a desarrollarse entre los hispanos las fuerzas de la Santa Iglesia*.¹³⁵ In the opposite case, it was argued that the Hispanic clergy had books that were as good as the Roman ones. Undoubtedly they invoked the theological tradition of the Visigoth monarchy of Toledo.¹³⁶

The image that was created around the king of Aragon and count of Barcelona, Peter the Catholic from the other side of the Pyrenees was also significant. Killed at Muret defending the philo-Cathar lords in the French Midi against the crusades of Simón de Montfort, he added another negative element to the fame built up around the Hispanics in general on the other side of the Pyrenees.¹³⁷ If not a heretic (his sobriquet speaks for itself), the monarch would be *fautor de herejes*, something

132. The usefulness of this work by the polygraph from Santander for the world of medievalism is dealt with in Mitre Fernández, Emilio. "Las herejías medievales en la Historia de los Heterodoxos españoles", *Historia de los Heterodoxos Españoles. Estudios*, Ramon Teja, Silvia Acerbi, dirs. Santander: PubliCan-Real Sociedad Menéndez Pelayo, 2012: 201-223. Of interest for the European heresies with roots in the Peninsula in the high medieval period is the recent synthesis by Grau, Sergi. *Cátaros e Inquisición en los reinos hispánicos (siglos XII-XIV)*. Madrid: Cátedra, 2012.

133. Sanctus Gregorius. "Registrum", *Patrologiae. Cursus completus*. Paris: Jacques-Paul Migne editorem, 1853: CXLVIII, col. 339-340 (1, 64); Gallego Blanco, Enrique. *Relaciones entre la Iglesia...*: 119. Earlier, Alcuin of York had defined adoptionism as *vecina peste del error hispánico* ("pestilence nearby to Spanish mistake"). Alcuin of York. "Carta de Alcuino a Leidrado y Nwefridio obispos y a Benito abad y a los fieles Gotia", *Beato de Liébana. Obras completas y complementarias II. Documentos de su entorno histórico y literario*, eds. Alberto del Campo, Juan González Echegaray, Leslie J. Freeman, José Luis Casado. Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 2004: 587.

134. Rivera Recio, Juan Francisco. *El arzobispo don Bernardo de Cluny*. Rome: Iglesia Nacional Española, 1962: 14.

135. "Roman law and customs", "Toledan law", "the darkness of ignorance completely erased (and) the force of the Holy Church began to develop among the Hispanics". Falque Rey, Emma, ed. *Historia compostelana*. Madrid: Akal, 1994: 297.

136. Ruiz Asencio, José Manuel; Herrero Jimeno, Mauricio, eds. *Crónica de Veynte Reyes*. Burgos: Ayuntamiento de Burgos, 1991: 261-262.

137. Alvira, Martín. *12 de septiembre de 1213...*



extremely serious as he was warned about it in an important missive from the papal legate, Arnaldo Amaury.¹³⁸

Because of these heretical, Islamic and Judaic contaminations, would this Hispania be judged similarly heretical as these other geographic areas cited?¹³⁹

Beyond of these hypothesis, we can underline that the religious features, independent of their orthodoxy, were a kind of interested game around identity and alterity around the Hispanic society.

4. The Late Middle Ages in the West: the Hundred Year's War and the accentuation of identities

The great armed struggle at the end of the Middle Ages known as the Hundred Year's War was mainly a conflict (or series of conflicts) between the French and English crowns, although it also affected other western countries.¹⁴⁰ Moreover, it overlapped with the serious religious split of the Western Schism, which contributed to poisoning the relations between the sides even more.¹⁴¹ The fact that the schism was considered by some as close to heresy added more fuel to the fire given that both were characterised by the same fault: pertinacity.

4.1 The Anglo-French prototype

In order to defense the own reason, it was usual to accuse to the other part being a kind of bad Christians: schismatics and, by extension, even heretics. A circumstance that would accentuate what were, until then, vague national sentiments.

Une nouveauté: les Anglais parlent anglais, as one of the leading specialists in the conflict wrote ironically.¹⁴² That John Wycliffe was a promoter of a version of the Bible in English at the end of the fourteenth century may be doubtful.¹⁴³ This topic,

138. "heretics' maker". Pierre des Vaux-de-Cernay. *Histoire albigeoise...*: 151.

139. A question dealt with as an appendix in Mitre Fernández, Emilio; Alvira Cabrer, Martín; Martínez Tur, José Emilio. "El debate ortodoxia-heresía...": 181-194.

140. As an example, see Mitre Fernández, Emilio. "Castilla ante la guerra de los Cien Años: Actividad militar y diplomática de los orígenes del conflicto al fin de las Grandes Treguas (c.1340-c.1415)", *Guerra y diplomacia en la Europa Occidental (1280-1480)*. XXXI Semana de Estudios Medievales, Estella, 19 a 23 de julio de 2004. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 2005: 199-235.

141. There is a clearly organised summary of this spiritual conflict in Álvarez Palenzuela, Vicente Ángel. *El cisma de Occidente*. Madrid: Rialp, 1982.

142. "A novelty, the English speak English". Philippe Contamine referring to the abandoning of French—a more cultured language but the language of the enemy—by the British upper classes. Contamine, Philippe. *La vie quotidienne pendant la guerre de Cent Ans. France et Angleterre (XIV^e siècle)*. Paris: Hachette, 1976: 20-22.

143. For this question, see Hudson, Anne. "Wyclif and the English Language", *Wyclif in his Times*, Anthony Kenny, ed. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1986: 85-103



however, can be given a non-trivial meaning: that of a “national” dignification of a language by a theologian considered a distant precursor of the reform movements of the 1500s.

In the later phases of the Hundred Years War, the fierce fighting in France between the Burgundians (allies of the English for some time) and Armagnacs was frequently marked by this *standard* accusation of bad Christians.¹⁴⁴ Joan of Arc's presence on the battlefields of France (1429-1431) would be the emotional replica of a widespread feeling of impotence. Although an ephemeral phenomenon, it would encourage an elemental political-messianic rhetoric. A good expression of this was in the well-known Letter to the English dated 22nd of March 1429 to the King of England and his captains urging them to lift the siege of Orleans and leave France. The text was included in the accusation against the heroine in Rouen some months later.¹⁴⁵

The drama ended with her execution by burning as a “heretic, idolater, apostate and relapse” a string of invectives which included some technical incompatibilities that, in the heat of the conflict, did not appear to bother her accusers very much.¹⁴⁶

4.2 Back to the Hispanic peculiarities

The implications of the generalised war in the Peninsula became autochthonous dynastic conflicts that, on more than one occasion, took on an unequivocal religious hue.¹⁴⁷

Let us see some examples. The confrontation between Peter I of Castile and his half-brother Henry of Trastámara was heightened by the bad press spewed by the legitimate monarch. These included accusations of *bougre* [synonym of heretic] y *mauvais crestyen* [evil Christian]¹⁴⁸ and of collusion with enemies of the Christian faith: the Jews and, on occasions, the Moors in the Kingdom of Granada.¹⁴⁹

Years later, the Portuguese war of succession on the death of Ferdinand I, gave rise to a vague Portuguese national feeling that was cloaked in a religious sentiment. The siege of Lisbon by Castilian forces concluded in a failure as related by the

144. One of the first episodes in this conflict has been excellently recreated by Guenée, Bernard. *Un meurtre, une société. L'assassinat de duc d'Orléans. 23 novembre 1407*. Paris: Gallimard, 1992.

145. In Duby, Georges; Duby, Andrée, eds. *Les procès de Jeanne d'Arc*. Paris: Gallimard, 1973: 33-35.

146. Mitre Fernández, Emilio. *Iglesia, herejía y vida política...*: 155.

147. For this see the recent overview in Mitre Fernández, Emilio. “Tensiones sociales y políticas de apaciguamiento en el ascenso y consolidación de los Trastámara (Una panorámica)”. *Edad Media. Revista de Historia*, 8 (2007): 279-294, especially 280-283.

148. Russell, Peter E. “The War in Spain and Portugal”, *Froissart Historian*, John J. N. Palmer, ed. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 1981: 89.

149. The great expert on this question was Julio Valdeón, from a work whose thesis he insisted on various occasions. Valdeón, Julio. *Los judíos de Castilla y la revolución Trastámara*. Valladolid: Graficas A. Martin, 1968: 37-40.



chronicler Fernão Lopes in tones that ranged from epic to martyrdom.¹⁵⁰ In the courts of Coimbra in 1385, the Portuguese jurist Joao das Regras disqualified John I of Trastámara as candidate-consort to the Portuguese throne. The reason: he and his followers were *çismáticos y herejes* as militants on the Avignonese papal side. He asked rhetorically, *como tomaríamos nos taes pessoas por nossos reis e senhores?*¹⁵¹

Months later, and with two setbacks in between (the disaster of Aljubarrota and the invasion by John of Gaunt, Duke of Lancaster as the pretender to the Castilian throne),¹⁵² John I of Trastámara attempted to raise the spirits of his loyal followers in the courts in Segovia in 1386. Resorting to xenophobia with a marked religious tone, he railed against the English who were always *ayudadores e dieron fauor en las çismas que fueron en la Yglesia de Dios fasta oy*¹⁵³ at a moment when the western Schism had placed the two of them on opposing sides. One of the examples of the perfidiousness of the English was Thomas Becket's murder (1170) at the hands of a group of knights from the entourage of Henry II Plantagenet, induced by imprudent declarations by the king. It was supposed that this left the pretender morally discredited and, thus, his dynastic aspirations delegitimated.

5. Conclusions

To conclude, it is worth mentioning another interesting outlook that gave some dynasties in the Peninsula a mystical symbolism. It granted them a special messianic *ethos* that tended to reinforce their political identity. This happened with the royal house of Aragon whose component states were metaphorically compared with a bunch of reeds by the chronicler Muntaner (1265-1336).¹⁵⁴ In line with a Joaquinism *lato sensu*, some of its princes were augured a brilliant destiny.¹⁵⁵

As Alain Milhou highlighted, Arnau de Vilanova (c. 1240-1311) would be the first author who would transfer to the Aragonese dynasty (James II of Aragon,

150. The documentary support for the effusions of the chronicler has been studied by Viegas, Valentino. *Lisboa. A força da Revolução (1383-1385). Os documentos comprovam Fernao Lopes*. Lisbon: Livros Horizonte, 1985.

151. "schismatics and heretics" "How could we take these kind of people such as own king and lords?". Lopes, Fernão. *Cronica de D. Joao I*, ed. Humberto Baquero Moreno. Barcelos: Livraria Civilização, 1983: I, 401.

152. The vicissitudes suffered by the king and the kingdom over these years. Suárez, Luis. *Juan I rey de Castilla (1379-1390)*. Madrid: Revista de Occidente, 1955: 59-107. First of the set of works this reseracher dedicated to the second Trastámara.

153. "They helped and supported the schisms that suffered the God's Church until now". John I of Castile. "Cortes de Segovia de 1386", *Cortes de los antiguos reinos de León y Castilla*. Madrid: Imprenta y estereotipia de M. Rivadeneyra, 1863: II, 351.

154. Ramon Muntaner, *Crónica*, ed. Joan Francesc Vidal Jové. Madrid: Alianza, 1970: 69.

155. A classic work on these questions is the old book (reedited twice recently) by Pou i Martí, José María. *Visionarios, beguinos y fraticelos catalanes (siglos XIII-XV)*. Vic: Editorial Seráfica, 1930. Recently, the theme has been tackled by Aurell, Martin. "Mesianisme royal de la Couronne d'Aragon (14-15 siècles)". *Annales. Histoire, Sciences Sociales*, 52/1 (1997): 119-155.



his brother Fadrique of Sicily) the messianic prophecies about the conquest of Jerusalem or the creation of a universal royalty until then applied to Germany or the French royal family.¹⁵⁶ This messianism reinforced what, in principle, had been an expansionist policy of the Crown of Aragon towards the south of the Iberia Peninsula.¹⁵⁷ This image would contribute years later to giving a new impulse to the Franciscan Francisc Eiximenis (c. 1340-1409) from Girona when he proclaimed about the royal house of Aragon: *D'aquesta casa és profetat que deu aconseguir monarchia quasi sobre lo món*.¹⁵⁸

And what can one say about the Castilian Trastámara dynasty as the heir to the Hebraic monarchic traditions,¹⁵⁹ or the case of the Portuguese house of Avis as inaugurating a Seventh Age of the World.¹⁶⁰

Talk about an officialist messianism-millennarianism that neutralised other more or less subversive ones¹⁶¹ does not seem excessively unreasonable.

156. Milhou, Alain. "La chauve-souris, le Nouveau David et le roi caché (trois images de l'empereur des derniers temps dans le monde ibérique: XIII-XVII siècles)". *Mélanges de la Casa de Velázquez*, 18 (1982): 64.

157. Guadalajara Medina, José. *Las profecías del anticristo en la Edad Media*. Madrid: Gredos, 1996: 199.

158. "It is prophesied that this house must achieve monarchy over almost all the world". Guadalajara Medina, José. *Las profecías del anticristo...*: 212. As a counterpoint in the mid fourteenth century, the Franciscan visionary Juan de Rupescissa (or Roquetaillade) established 1370 as the date for the clash between the supporters of the Antichrist (Gibelines in Italy, kings of Spain, tyrants of Germany and the king of England) and the armies of the faithful led by the Pope, the king of France and King Charles of Bohemia. Guadalajara Medina, José. *Las profecías del anticristo...*: 171.

159. Pablo de Santa Maria. *La creación de un discurso historiográfico en el Cuatrocientos castellano: las Siete Edades del Mundo de Pablo de Santa Maria (Estudio y Edición crítica)*, ed. Juan Carlos Conde. Salamanca: Universidad de Salamanca, 1999. A messianism that would be a bridge between the Medieval and Modern Ages. Milhou, Alain. *Colón y su mentalidad mesiánica en el ambiente del franciscanismo español*. Valladolid: Casa-museo de Colón, 1983.

160. Lopes, Fernão. *Cronica de D. Joao I...*: I, 349.

161. In relation with this, two scatological tendencies that arose in the Church from a very early date could be added, as recalled in Carozzi, Claude. *Visiones apocalípticas en la Edad Media. El fin del mundo y la salvación del alma*. Madrid: Siglo XXI, 2000: 173-176.

